

Critical analysis of Ṣahīḥ Bukhārī's Kitāb al-Ṣulḥ

Karam Siyavoshi

Associate Professor, Department of Theology, Faculty of Humanities, Bu-Ali Sina University, Hamedan, Iran, (corresponding author); karam.siyavoshi@basu.ac.ir

Sajjād Yousufi Sorud

Master's student, Department of Theology, Bu-Ali Sina University, Hamedan, Iran; sy8164787@gmail.com

Received: 24/08/2022

Accepted: 04/01/2023

Introduction

One of the sections of "Ṣahīḥ Bukhārī" which has been considered as a superior place among Suni hadith books and from the viewpoint of their scholars is "Kitāb al-Ṣulḥ". Considering the fact that the traditions of "Kitāb al-Ṣulḥ" are highly reflective, analyzed, adapted, and critiqued those traditions with the aim of illuminating them, in order to make optimal use of traditional sources, and to explain the concept, place and comprehensive purpose of peace in the Islamic religion, as well as intellectual refinement and religious revival, as well as reviewing the aforementioned hadiths in terms of authenticity of the hadiths, the correctness of words and concepts, and the comprehensiveness of the discussion and proportionality of the traditionals in the this book in accordance with the verses of the Holy Quran and credible hadiths, makes this research important and necessary.

Materials and methods

"Ṣulḥ" literally means peace and reconciliation. Also, "Ṣulḥ" means "righteousness" and "anti-corruption". In the Qur'an, The two words "Ṣulḥ" and "Iṣlāḥ" are sometimes compared to "corruption" and sometimes to "sin". In many cases, "Ṣulḥ" is specific to the elimination of hatred and malice among people. In terminology, "Ṣulḥ" has different meanings, and basically it means an agreement and compromise to resolve a conflict between two or more people or groups. Sometimes it is called "the state that arises due to the end or absence of war and unrest". Sometimes the process of ending war or conflict is called "Ṣulḥ". The Prophet's peace with the polytheists of Mecca (*Hudaybiyyah*) and Imam Hassan's peace with Mu'awiya are two examples of

great Islamic peaces. This research was carried out with a descriptive, analytical and critical method, and so far no independent research has been organized in this field.

Results and findings

Title design for chapters in traditional books is a necessary and unavoidable matter. Besides, connection the title with the topics of the chapter is very important. Two basic objections to Bukhari in Kitāb al-Ṣulḥ and throughout Ṣahīḥ Bukhārī; One is the lack of knowing titles, but mainly the presentation of long and unclear titles for the chapters, the other is the inconsistency and disproportion between the titles of the chapters and the traditions mentioned in them. As the title of the first chapter, "*mā jā' fī al-iṣlāḥ bayn al-nās*" is very general and includes everything related to peace and reconciliation. Despite this, Bukhārī has given only two traditions in the first chapter, and the first tradition has nothing to do with peace! The title of the second chapter, "*laysa al-kādhb, alladhī yuṣliḥu bayn al-nās*" is also taken from the tradition of the same chapter. For the third chapter, Bukhārī has chosen the title "*qawl al-Imam li aṣḥābihi: idhhabū ibnā nuṣliḥu*" which is taken from the tradition of the chapter and does not deserve to be named as the title in any way. Another point is that its only tradition is apparently in the first chapter, which is one of the serious defects of Ṣahīḥ Bukhārī. The fourth chapter is named with the phrase "*an yuṣliḥā baynahuma, Ṣulḥan wa al-Ṣulḥu khayr*" which is a part of verse 128 of Surah Nisa. This chapter also has only one tradition about reconciliation between couples. The title of the fifth chapter is the phrase "*idhā iṣṭalahū 'alā Ṣulḥin jawrin faṣṣulḥo mardūdun*" which Bukhārī assumed it from all the hadiths related to this topic. Among the few traditions of this chapter, except for one tradition, the rest of the traditions, do not have much connection with the title and topic of the chapter and contain scattered and unrelated topics.

Bukhārī named the sixth chapter with the long phrase "*kaifa Yuktabu: ḥādḥā ma ṣālah fulānu ibn fulan, wa fulānu ibn fulan, wa in lam yunsibuhū ila qabilatihi aw nasabihi*" instead of which, he could have put forward the short title "*kaifa yaktubu al-muṣālahah*". Its content is also related to the peace of Hudaybiyyah, which is facing many shortcomings and incoherence. In the seventh chapter titled "*Ṣulḥ ma'a mushrikin*" no useful and valuable material is presented. The eighth chapter, entitled "*al-Ṣulḥ fī al-diyah*", has only one tradition that shows the weakness and defects of Bukhārī's method in this regard. But the content of the ninth chapter with the inappropriate and long title "*qawlu al-nabi pbuh li Ibnihi Hassan Ibn Ali, raḍiyallhu anhumā: ibnī ḥādḥā sayyidun wa la'alla allahu an yusliha bihi bayna fī'atayn 'azīmatayn. wa qawlihi: 'faaṣliḥū baynahuma*" is facing with serious bias and deficiency

Bukhārī named The 10th chapter with the interrogative phrase "*hal yushīru al-Imam biṣṣulḥ*"? It is mentioned that this title does not match the content of the two traditions of the chapter! The 11th chapter has the appropriate title "*faḍlul al-iṣlāḥ bayn al-nass wa al-'adl baynahum*", but I wish Bukhārī had reported some hadiths related to the title. The twelfth chapter, with the not so short and telling title "*idhā ashāra al-Imam biṣṣulḥ fa aba ,hakama alaihi bilhukmi al-bayyin*", has only one tradition, and according to the contents of the Sunni and Shiite traditional sources, the authenticity of this tradition is also doubtful. Bukhārī named the 13th chapter "*al-ṣulḥu bayna al-ghuramā and aṣḥāb al-mīrath wa al-mujazifateh fī dhālika*", and he started it with a speech or a fatwa from Ibn Abbas, which Bukhārī's method is not acceptable in this matter either! In addition, this chapter contains only one traditional that has little to do with the issue of peace in the strict sense of the word. Bukhārī named the last chapter of the Kitāb al-Ṣulḥ with the short title "*al-Ṣulḥu bi al-ddayn wa al-'ayn*", which contains only one tradition, which is similar to the tradition of the tenth chapter!

Conclusion

Compilation of a collection of hadiths on the subject of peace among Sunni hadith communities has apparently been done for the first time in Ṣahīḥ Bukhārī. Despite the valuableness of Bukhārī's action, there are many problems and objections to his "*Kitab al-Ṣulḥ*": the titles of the chapters are not named correctly and accurately, in most of the chapters only one tradition is reported. In addition, the traditions presented overlap! Most of the traditions of "*Kitab-o al-Ṣulḥ*" are about peace after personal quarrels and differences. Even in the cases where Bukhārī discussed important peaces such as "*Peace of Hodaybiyyah*" and "*Peace of Imam Hasan*", he presented them in the form of scattered, incoherent, flawed and biased and dishonest traditionals - intentionally or unintentionally.

Keywords: peace in Islam, *Kitab-o al-Ṣulḥ*, Ṣahīḥ Bukhārī, critical analysis.