

## **Analysis of the Tradition Attributed to Imam Hussein (as) Regarding the Disapproval of Female Governance**

***Habibullah Halimi Jelodar***

Associate Professor, Department of Qur'an and Hadith Studies, Faculty of Theology and Islamic Studies, University of Mazandaran, Babolsar, Iran. Email: [jlodar@umz.ac.ir](mailto:jlodar@umz.ac.ir)

Received: 26/04/2023

Accepted: 30/08/2023

### **Introduction**

Throughout history, humanity has taken a path of extremes and regarding women, and even today, this process continues in both the East and the West. The primary reason for this disorderly and unfavorable judgment regarding the character of women is the ignorance and foolishness of such individuals. However, from the Islamic point of view, both men and women are foundational and essential pillars of society, each playing distinct yet complementary roles. It must be emphasized that both are human beings and both are beneficial to the society, but this does not imply that they share equal rights and duties, just as the hands and the tongue have different roles and duties while both are vital to the body. This point should be emphasized that the cultures and customs that govern societies have greatly influenced the roles and effectiveness of men and women; However, some matters, such as hard labor for men and upbringing of child for women, given their respective physical and psychological makeup, take precedence.

### **Materials and Methods**

The central question of this article is whether the tradition, attributed to Imam Hussein (as), which criticizes the rule of the Queen of Sheba, and disapproves female leadership and management, is a reliable tradition. One of the methods for examining a hadith is to analyze its Hadith text report through primary sources. Therefore, this study examines three key Quotes of the tradition. If this hadith is traced in earlier sources, it appears in two books from the 4th century and one from the 7th century. One source is "Al-Amali" by Muḥammad ibn Ali ibn al-Husayn ibn Musa ibn Babawayh al-Qummi (Sheikh Ṣadūq), d.381 AH Another is "Al-Futūḥ" by Muḥammad ibn Ali ibn A'tham Kufi (d. 314 or 320 AH). The third is the tradition in "Al-Luhūf" by Ibn Ṭāwūs (d. 664 AH) whose text bears no resemblance to Amali's tradition except at the end. Ibn Ṭāwūs narrated from Muḥammad ibn Nu'man (Shaykh Mufid), d. 413 AH. According to Ibn Ṭāwūs, Sheikh

Mufid quoted it from the book "Mawlid al-Nabi wa Mawlid al-Awsiya(PBUH)" with his chain of transmission to Imam Sadiq (as); on the one hand, Sheikh Mufid's book is currently unavailable, but its name is mentioned in the al-Dhari'ah as "Mawlid al-Nabi wa al-A'immah" and the Agha Buzurg emphasizes that Ibn Ṭāwūs has mentioned this book in their books as "Mawlid al-Nabi wa Mawlid al-Awsiya (PBUH)" and Bahrani has mentioned it as "Mawlid al-Nabi wa Mawlid al-Asfiyya wa al-Awsiya ()". On the third side, the contents of Sheikh Mufid's tradition are about the meeting of angels and jinn and some issues that are not similar to Sheikh Ṣadūq's tradition. However, at the end, it reaches the same part where a Kufic person, of course with another name called "Abba Hirra al-Azdi", asks Imam Hussein (as) the reason for his departure from the divine and prophetic shrines, to which the Imam (as) answers.

### Results and Findings

One of the traditions cited to argue against women's ability to govern is a tradition attributed to Imam Hussein (as). This ḥadith appears in three sources: "Al-Futūḥ" by Ibn A'tham al-Kufi (d. 314 or 320 AH), "Al-Amali" by Sheikh Ṣadūq (d. 381 AH), and "Al-Luhūf" by Ibn Ṭāwūs (d. 664 AH), where Ibn Ṭāwūs cites it from the book of Sheikh Mufid (d. 314 AH).

What is being considered in the present study is the continuation of the tradition after "And Allah will not give them authority over anyone who would humiliate them" which includes the phrase "Until they were humiliated among the people of Saba, when a woman became their queen and ruled over their wealth and blood." In it, the Imam (as) disapproved the management and rule of women by disapproval the Queen of Saba. The tradition narrated in Al-Futūḥ by Ibn A'tham al-Kufi is short and without a chain of transmission and has the above continuation; the tradition narrated in al-Amali by Sheikh Ṣadūq has no similarity with the tradition narrated in Al-Luhūf by Ibn Ṭāwūs (quoted by Sheikh Mufid) except in the final part of the tradition - which is the subject of this article - but in Al- Luhūf's tradition, unlike the Amali tradition, the aforementioned continuation is present. Based on the studies conducted, the present study, while accepting the Amali tradition - which does not have the final continuation - does not accept the traditions of Ibn A'tham and Ibn Ṭāwūs for several reasons; first, because the personality of Ibn A'tham al-Kufi is multiple and troubled in all aspects of his lineage, including name, religion, and credibility; second, because there is no chain of transmission; third, because the transmitters of Ibn A'tham al-Kufi and Ibn Ṭāwūs are different from the Amali's transmitter; fourth, because the content

of the ḥadīth of Ibn Ṭāwūs - who narrated from Sheikh Mufid - is completely different from the content of the Amali tradition, except in the last part; Fifth, the source of Ibn Ṭāwūs' ḥadīth is unknown; sixth, considering the analysis of the story of the Queen of Sheba in the Holy Quran, the disapproval of the Queen of Sheba and, based on it, the disapproval of women's rule in this tradition is incorrect; therefore, considering the absence of even a single trace of this tradition in sources before the fourth century, the heterogeneity of Ibn A'tham al-Kufi's personality, the non-existence and being-unknown of the source of Ibn Ṭāwūs' tradition, the inconsistency of the continuation with the general atmosphere of the Quran, etc., it can be claimed that the continuation of the tradition in the statement of Imam Hussein (as) did not exist and was perhaps fabricated by people who had hostile personalities towards women; therefore, the aforementioned tradition is considered to be a disturbed and unimportant type of tradition.

### **Conclusion**

One of the most important points to be emphasized in studying and examining traditions is to pay attention to the various aspects of that tradition so that it does not contradict common sense, definitive history, definitive science, and the Holy Quran. Another important point that should be noted in such cases is that the culture that governs societies may have an effect on the fabrication of superstitions and the distortion of facts and realities. For example, in the present article, what has prompted the author to analyze the tradition narrated from Imam Hussein (as) was the inconsistency of the final words of the tradition with the culture that governs the Holy Quran, which was in the disapproval of the Queen of Sheba, which resulted in the disapproval of women's rule. The reason for the inconsistency is in this part, where the Holy Quran mentions the Queen of Sheba in a good way and praises her approach to the invitation of Prophet Sulayman (as); while at the end of the tradition narrated from Imam Hussein (as), she is disapproved. This could be due to the culture of the people who consider women to be parasites, so they fabricate everything and add to the traditions of the Imam (as).

**Keywords:** disapproval of female governance, Queen of Sheba, Ibn Bābwayh Qomi, Ibn A'tham Kufi, Isnad and implication analysis.